

## COUNCIL

Tuesday 14 March 2023

### MEMBER QUESTION TIME – Part 2

#### Questions submitted in accordance with Standing Order 12

---

#### 36. Councillor Julie Glentworth

Would the Portfolio Holder for Regeneration, Planning and Transport please confirm that, as the removal of the on-site mechanics from the Stockbridge Depot in Keighley, is causing turnaround times of up to 6 days per breakdown because broken vehicles are having to join the repair queue in Bradford, the productivity levels of the vehicles and operators are inevitably down and could he provide appropriate figures to quantify this and would he also be so kind as to confirm how on earth it was decided that the appropriate location for a vehicle wash facility at Stockbridge Depot, was beneath electricity cables, thus rendering it inoperable?

#### Response

I have no idea where these allegations have come from but they are completely incorrect.

- There are no changes to the mechanic provision at Keighley. We provide a mechanic and workshop van for minor repairs and maintenance as we have for many years. The site does not have the workshop facilities to provide major repairs, maintenance and testing as there is only very small basic shed for providing shelter when working on vehicles. This has always been the case since circa 2005.
- All Keighley vehicles are planned to be maintained at Shearbridge Depot, usually out of normal working hours where possible to avoid service delivery issues. Unfortunately, there will be some vehicles and services that are required to be maintained or repaired inside the normal working pattern of the service as has always been the case. Additional workshop resource is sent to Keighley as required and where practical.
- The large vehicle wash facility was removed many years ago which I believe was due to the location, costs and potential for the site to be sold at the time. It was replaced with a pressure wash system which is still in use today.
- Productivity levels are monitored and managed by individual services. Stockbridge is used by Highways, Street Scene and Waste Services. I am not aware of any productivity issues being reported and have checked with staff on site who are also not aware of any issues.

### 37. Councillor Brendan Stubbs

Can the Portfolio Holder please detail how many complaints have been received about dog fouling each month over the past 3 years and how many fixed penalty notices or prosecutions have been issued or taken place over the same time period?

#### Response

Year	Month	Number of cases	FPNs
2020	Apr	29	
2020	May	20	
2020	Jun	34	
2020	Jul	44	1
2020	Aug	40	
2020	Sep	59	
2020	Oct	46	
2020	Nov	48	
2020	Dec	69	
2021	Jan	84	1
2021	Feb	76	1
2021	Mar	74	
2021	Apr	33	
2021	May	58	1
2021	Jun	30	2
2021	Jul	40	1
2021	Aug	52	
2021	Sep	40	1
2021	Oct	45	
2021	Nov	39	3
2021	Dec	47	
2022	Jan	109	
2022	Feb	81	

2022	Mar	105	
2022	Apr	47	1
2022	May	31	2
2022	Jun	15	
2022	Jul	11	
2022	Aug	22	
2022	Sep	18	
2022	Oct	23	
2022	Nov	12	1
2022	Dec	19	1
2023	Jan	31	1
2023	Feb	41	1
2023	Mar	17	

For further context, some of the above cases are reported to street cleansing staff only whilst others are reported to the Environmental Enforcement Team who receive complaints from the Contact Centre about dog fouling if there is additional information about the complaint that will allow Wardens or Enforcement Officers to follow up, for example if the person in control of the dog can be identified or if the fouling is happening regularly at a specific location/time of day. Wardens will undertake patrols at such locations and times to identify culprits – but catching offenders in the act is very difficult and not often achievable, especially when Wardens are in uniform and people therefore tend to comply and pick up the mess. Please note also that a change in call centre IT systems means that some of the data reporting suite isn't fully in place yet so there is a gap in the data for recent months that can be retrospectively filled in when the work is completed.

Levels of dog fouling FPNs are low across the country, highlighting the difficulty in catching offenders, and it is more cost-effective to try and use positive behaviour change methods to try and make a difference. In seeking to address and prevent dog fouling, wardens regularly place warning signs at hot spots and engage with the public to ensure people are carrying dog poo bags. We also write to householders where there is regular fouling on a street/neighbourhood. If the complaint is about dog fouling on a highway without any supporting evidence, then these complaints are directed to the Street Cleansing service for removal of the fouling.

Keep Britain Tidy (KBT) conducted a national survey and 52% of people thought Dog Fouling was a major environmental issue, yet when they compared this to their own independent inspection of streets, only 4% of streets showed any evidence of dog

fouling, suggestion a significant distortion between the perception and actual extent of the problem.

Sources suggest that approximately 25% of homes in the UK own dogs, and 9 out of 10 owners do pick up their dog's waste. So KBT felt that as the vast majority of people are doing the right thing, and that dog owners have an affection for their dog, using an advertising and social media campaign merging these two behavioural push factors would be the most effective line of attack. Since 2020 Neighbourhood Services have been deploying floor stickers, bin stickers and some signage from Keep Britain Tidy's Dog Fouling campaign "Do It For Your Dog".

One other common experience that local authorities all tend to observe is a spike in reports in winter and our data shows that in each year January-March often sees a spike in reports. Theories range from the short days meaning some dog-owners feel more secure in getting away with not picking up the waste unobserved through to the inclement weather that is more commonly experienced January to March meaning some owners are less inclined to go out with their dog or spend more time hunting down the waste if the dog was not right next to them at the time.

### **38. Councillor Anna Watson**

Can the Leader of the Council update us on which Councillor and which officer are leading on the Climate Emergency for Bradford Council; and also which Councillor and officer are leading on making Bradford a Plastic-Free Council?

#### **Response**

The lead for Climate Emergency is Councillor Ferriby supported by Councillor Cunningham, who leads on the Plastic-Free agenda as part of his role as Assistant Exec Member for Climate and Culture. The lead officer for both elements is the Strategic Director, Place.

### **39. Councillor Luke Majkowski**

Can the portfolio holder please provide an updated schedule for lamp posts that have been cut down throughout the district and are still awaiting replacement 2 years later?

#### **Response**

The Smart Street Lighting Project team is aware that there are some lighting columns that were cut down that have not yet been replaced, there are around 30 columns in total that require replacement and it is planned to undertake this work using the in-house resource rather than the project contractor Amey. A schedule will be produced in the next few weeks and shared with members.

### **40. Councillor Mike Pollard**

Would the Portfolio Holder for Education, Employment and Skills confirm that he agrees with the view of Education Secretary Gillian Keegan, that it is unreasonable for teachers to join strike action without informing their Headteacher of their intention to do so and would he confirm that he would be supportive of proposals to introduce

a law similar to that in France whereby teachers are obliged to provide their Headteacher with at least 48 hours' notice of their intention to take strike action?

### **Response**

Management in schools can ask staff members if they intend to strike, however the staff members are not obliged to tell school management of their intention. Our advice to schools in Bradford, is that school management are to prepare for all staff that are members of the respective trade union(s) that is/are striking to not be in work on the days of the strikes, unless they are told otherwise. The respective trade unions share relevant information to enable the head to deduce the total number of staff likely to take part in the action. Our advice to schools ensures that they remain legally compliant and can manage their schools in the most efficient way. We want to ensure that staff members in school are free to conduct their right to strike and the school does not jeopardise or challenge a members of staff's right to strike. Most staff have the best interests of children at heart and so are supportive of headteachers being enabled to plan for strike days. The guidance provided by the DfE on 16th Jan 2023 is non statutory.

### **41. Councillor Geoff Winnard**

In view of the long delay in deciding whether speed cameras can be installed, would the Portfolio Holder for Regeneration, Planning and Transport detail the alternative interventions that the Council are now planning, to reduce speeding on the A650 Bingley Bypass?

### **Response**

The Council is working with the police and the West Yorkshire Safety Camera Partnership on this issue. The Camera Partnership has recently released the new Deployment Criteria for cameras and time is required to carry out the appropriate checks. We have also recently installed speed/volume counters on the bypass to assist this process. The police are carrying out roads policing activity on the bypass at present.

### **42. Councillor Brendan Stubbs**

While we all welcome the move to energy efficient street lighting it has resulted in the creation of dark spots in between columns that can make it difficult for some members of the public to safely get around after dark. Can the portfolio Holder for regeneration explain what steps are taken to ensure that replacement LED streetlights are providing good levels of lighting on streets and that dark spots are minimised.

### **Response**

All the replacement lighting is being designed in accordance with the British Standards to ensure it meets the required lighting levels, these designs are then checked for compliance by the project team. Due to the light distribution of LED luminaires they do not spread the light around in the way that SOX/SON luminaires

did. This is more efficient but also reduces light pollution. If there are any particular areas of concern, please let me know and we will review the designs again.

**43. Councillor Celia Hickson**

Do Asset Management have any targets for them to remove fly tipping from land they manage? If so, what percentage of these are removed in this time and will they confirm their plans to remove fly tipping from land adjacent to Heysham Drive or the land on the former Rainbow Centre in Holmewood?

**Response**

As soon as Estate Management is informed of fly tipping on land it manages it requests quotes and places orders for the removal of the fly tipping from the Council's Ancillary Services Team or, if that team advises that it is unable to remove the fly tipping, external contractors are instructed. Estate Management does not remove the fly tipping itself and the time that it takes to remove the rubbish is dependent on Estate Management being informed of the fly-tipping, the time it takes to receive quotes and, the availability and capacity of the Ancillary Services Team or external contractors to carry out the work.

The Council can confirm that orders have been placed for the removal of the fly tipping on both sites.

**44. Councillor Andrew Loy**

Would the Portfolio Holder for Regeneration, Planning and Transport confirm what plans there are for on street electric vehicle charging points for households with no off street parking and what funding is available for this?

**Response**

Bradford Council has installed a growing number of EV charging points across the district and funding for these projects has come from the governments Office for Zero Emission Vehicles & Community Infrastructure Levy funds. Provision for charging points in streets without off-street parking is difficult as the potential for trip hazards due to trailing cables makes various options complicated.

West Yorkshire Combined Authority, in partnership with the five local councils, has recently been awarded £1.5m of Local Electric Vehicle Infrastructure (LEVI) funding. This is particularly aimed at residents without off-street parking. The project is likely to commence later in 2023/24 and will see another wave of charging infrastructure installed.

As of October 2022 there were 121 public electric vehicle charge points (EVCPs) available in the Bradford District. Bradford Council has installed 46 EV Public Charge points and another 23 have recently been installed and are almost ready to be switched on. In addition, after Easter 2023, additional EV charge points will be available at Ashlands Primary School, Ilkley and the new Heaton Crematorium site.

#### **45. Councillor Geoff Winnard**

Can the Leader of the Council please provide an update on the particular actions being taken to combat anti-Semitism across the Bradford District?

#### **Response**

We work closely with the Bradford Hate Crime Alliance (BCHA) who deliver sessions in schools including talks on anti-Semitism. In the last 12 months 34 sessions have been delivered in schools around hate crime awareness and reporting. Anti-Semitism is included in the presentation and talks to schools.

There have also been 11 roadshows in the last 12 months where the anti-hate crime message is taken which also includes faith based hate crime including main shopping centres and transport hubs.

We are also attending The West Yorkshire Hate Crime Reporting Centre where Alex Webster from the Community Security Trust provides regular reports and informs us of any tensions or issues affecting the Jewish communities.

We communicate with the trustees of the Bradford Reform Synagogue on a regular basis and coproduce the programme of the Holocaust Memorial Day with them. Members of the trust also join on an annual basis to join a debating panel for school pupils in the Council Chamber in City Hall. The debates discuss holocausts, the role of Bradford civic leaders and educational establishments in fostering peace and community cohesion.

The Stronger Communities Head of Service became a 'Friend of the Synagogue' after the work undertaken in 2014 to bring the Muslim community and the synagogue together to fund the roof repairs. He is on their mailing list and is kept abreast of all developments at the Bradford Synagogue. Our WY Police Community Engagement Team are also in direct regular contact with the trustees and the police provide an officer to attend each Shabbat or other service at the Synagogue.

#### **46. Councillor Kevin Warnes**

Will the Leader of Council please clarify why the answers to Members' written questions submitted to our Council meeting on 24 January were not answered within 20 working days, as required by Standing Order 12.14 of the Council's Constitution, and can she assure us that this will not happen again?

#### **Response**

We are committed to providing the most accurate and comprehensive answers to the written member questions, which means it can unfortunately take a little longer to get the information and in the format requested. Sometimes questions involve complex issues or depend on obtaining information not just from different areas of the council but also from other agencies in the district and beyond, which can be a significant undertaking. To give some context 356 member questions have been answered in the last year alone for the full council meetings from March 2022 onwards. In addition, as you know my door is always open and I am contactable by phone or email for members who wish to discuss any urgent issues.

#### **47. Councillor Debbie Davies**

Can the Leader of the Council please confirm whether the Council concurs with the findings of the recent report by the homeless charity Shelter, which estimated that there are 345 homeless people in Bradford with 327 in temporary accommodation and 18 sleeping rough?

#### **Response**

Current figures show that there are 406 households being assisted under the “Relief” duty under the Homeless Reduction Act. These are households who have been found homeless (although not necessarily sleeping rough) who the Council is working with to secure longer term accommodation (for at least six months). Out of this 332 households are in Temporary Accommodation.

In terms of rough sleeping, the Council submits monthly returns to the Government and the average number of rough sleepers in the District is estimated at 11 rough sleepers. Whilst we are working with all known rough sleepers some of them are much harder to rehouse and some refuse to accept our offer of assistance.

The Housing Options Service assessed over 1,800 households who are homeless or threatened with homelessness during the first three quarters in 2022/23. The service has maintained a strong emphasis on agile customer engagement, early intervention and prevention, and customers are seen before they reach crisis point. As a result, our Homelessness Prevention performance is significantly higher than the Regional and National averages with over 74% of threat of homelessness cases positively resolved. At a recent visit by Senior DLUHC Officials they praised Bradford Council’s performance in achieving these impressive homelessness prevention outcomes.

#### **48. Councillor Debbie Davies**

Would the Leader of the Council confirm why it was deemed appropriate to compare Bradford MDC with Elmbridge Borough Council in Surrey, in documents leading up to the budget when Bradford has a population of over half a million whilst Elmbridge has just over 100,000 and the Government’s Local Government Settlement Funding for 2022/23 for Bradford MDC was £175 million compared to £2 million for Elmbridge BC?

#### **Response**

To highlight the unfairness in the national funding of local authorities and the fact that this council and our residents are losing out through no fault of our own. Whilst cutting its funding for local services, the government has shifted the burden on to the council taxpayer whilst at the same time failing to implement its own fairer funding proposals. If the government got on and introduced its fairer funding then it would provide the millions more for our residents’ local services every year that should be theirs by right. So we need to keep up this campaign because true levelling up has to include reform to how local authorities are financed.

Places like Bradford in the north of England are able to raise less in council tax and business rates than more privileged parts of the country in the south, yet we also

have significantly higher pressures on services. That risks a postcode lottery and it's something worth highlighting. Clearly no comparison is exactly like for like and it is per capita for illustrative purposes, but the facts are immutable. Those places that can least afford it, pay a higher proportion of their income on council tax than wealthier people and places.

Bradford has the second lowest Council Tax rate of all the local authorities in Yorkshire and Humber but this also means that we can raise less money for vital services than wealthier parts of the country. So when the Chancellor tells councils to increase Council Tax, a 5% increase in the Bradford district per dwelling raises only half the amount raised in Elmbridge in Surrey relative to size. So indicatively, if 5% raises £11m in Bradford, it would raise £22m in Elmbridge pro rata. That risks a postcode lottery.

Year on year, the gap between richer councils and poorer ones gets bigger. If the Government is serious about Levelling Up then this inherent inequality in the tax system needs to be addressed so that the gap between the North and South does not grow wider.

#### 49. Councillor Caroline Whitaker

With relation to all S106 money for the whole of Bradford District combined over the last 5 years, can the portfolio holder confirm how much money Bradford Council has received and has been allocated? How much has been received and awaiting allocation? And how much is still outstanding? Can this information be provided on a ward by ward basis?

#### Response

The Council received a total of £10,598,326 between 1st of January 2018 and 15th March 2023 from Section 106 payments. The breakdown by type of infrastructure against which Section 106 have been paid and spend/allocation, is shown below.

	Total	Spend	Allocated	Balance
Affordable Housing	£3,515,211.96	0	£2,625,000	£890,211.96
Education	£ 4,892,264.52	£2,969,938.21	£985,713.08	£936,613.23
Drainage	£14,544.19	£4,800.00	0	£9,744.19
Recreation	£970,796.32	140,475.87	£ 777,521.13	£52,799.32
Footpaths	£77,618.27	0	0	£77,618.27
Highways	£639,922.50	0	£639,922.50	0
Habitat Mitigation	£65,095.70	£18,890.70	£2,706	£43,499
Metro/ Public Transport	£260,721.24	£237,721.24	£23,000	0
Total	£10,436,174.70	£3,371,826.02	£4,513,940.21	£2,550,408.47

The information is currently not analysed by Ward. While we endeavour to ensure S106 funding is spent as quickly as possible it is important to recognise it is often provided as part of a larger funding package for large schemes, for instance the Harrogate Road New Line road improvement scheme included S106 money, and therefore can take some time to be spent.

**50. Councillor Julie Glentworth**

Would the Portfolio Holder for Regeneration, Planning and Transport please provide, for the benefit of residents detrimented by the predictable shift in traffic movements due to the introduction of the Clean Air Zone, what data has been collected to ascertain increased traffic flows on inappropriate routes and also increased pollution along these routes?

**Response**

The Council has published a press release and full report on displacement which includes the traffic data collected: Bradford Clean Air Zone and the results of traffic flow monitoring.

The report concludes that, in common with other cities that have introduced Clean Air Zones, displacement is not occurring in Bradford.

In relation to air quality data please see a link to the district's air quality annual status report (ASR) which is produced annually in line with statutory duties under the Environment Act (1995):

<https://www.bradford.gov.uk/environmental-health-and-pollution/air-quality/review-and-assessment-of-air-quality-in-the-bradford-metropolitan-district/>

The most recent data, which includes the period since the launch of the Clean Air Zone, will be published next year in line with Government statutory timescales.

**51. Councillor Mike Pollard**

Would the Leader of the Council confirm whether or not Labour backbench members were aware during Budget Council of the fact that they were supporting a 4% provision for staff pay increases when an offer of 6.42% had already been made and that they were thus supporting a budget with a £6m+ black hole, or were they as in the dark as non-Labour members?

**Response**

As I've explained in the answer to your other question on this subject (Question 16), we received notification of the offer that the National Employers had made to the trade unions after Full Council had met and set the budget on 23 February 2023.

It is simply not accurate or fair to say that Bradford Council made unrealistic budget assumptions. Bradford Council is not an outlier, being among the majority of local authorities in Yorkshire & Humber and nationally that took a difficult decision based on affordability and budgeted 4% for the pay award, indeed some local authorities have budgeted less.

The Employers Association have made this announcement on 23 February 2023 as a 'full and final offer'. However, it is by no means agreed. As things stand the negotiations will take a good number of months to progress through negotiation between the trade unions and the Employers Association.

## **52. Councillor Anna Watson**

Bradford Council joined the Trees for Streets sponsorship scheme and promoted it to local residents and town councils. Shipley Town Council paid for 10 trees to be planted and watered through the scheme. They were told that these would be planted by the end of 2022. As of now all the trees have not been planted (there is some debate as to how many and no one seems to know). Can the Council leader tell us when all of these trees will be planted and if they are not all able to be planted when will the money be returned to Shipley Town Council?

### **Response**

Two trees funded by Shipley Town Council through Trees for Streets were outstanding in December 2022 due to difficulties in finding suitable locations clear of underground services. The two outstanding trees have now been planted in Nab Wood Road.

## **53. Councillor Debbie Davies**

Would the Leader of Council please clarify for members why the council promotes membership of the Bradford District Credit Union?

### **Response**

The Council's relationship with the Credit Union is long standing. The Council founded the credit union in 1993 to help staff save together and assist colleagues in accessing low cost loans. Membership is open to all in the community and the Credit Union is a faith friendly organisation. Membership now stands over 9,500 today, with Bradford Council staff alone numbering over 3,000 members saving in the region of £7.2m. The Credit Union is not focused on generating profits for shareholders so can offer affordable interest rates on loans and other financial products. The Credit Union is a key partner in the Anti- Poverty Co-ordination Group and works with public health to offer schemes to support financially excluded residents to save and borrow safely.

The BDCU is listed as one of the many benefits our employees can access as it provides Bradford Council colleagues with a £25 bonus upon joining but also has some of the lowest APR rates on the market, which would be beneficial to colleagues if they were looking to take a loan.

We have been reviewing our overall employee benefits offer and have been looking at ways in which we can offer our colleagues better benefits that will support them through the cost-of-living crisis as well as help the Council attract talent. In the coming months we will be introducing further employee benefits and discounts to support colleagues as well as improve the employee benefits experience. Included within the new offering will be a range of discounts on simple things such as

shopping, eating in, dining out, entertainment, health, and fitness, and much more. The other benefits that will be introduced will include financial education and planning as well as benefits to support with health and wellbeing.

**54. Councillor Matt Edwards**

Will the Leader of Council please update us on what the Council has done to secure the redevelopment of the Copwood Centre site in Holmewood since the building was demolished? When are the landowning department organising the removal of substantial amounts of fly tipping and what are they doing to secure the site to prevent future fly-tipping?

**Response**

The land of the Copwood Centre site has been secured with security fencing around the perimeter. Unfortunately, this has been cut with an angle grinder to allow access and fly tipping, the fly tipping will be removed this week and the fencing re secured. The regeneration of Holmewood is being looked at specifically as part of the Local Plan development and this site forms part of that analysis. We are also engaging with Incommunities as the other significant land owner in the area to discuss potential joint approaches on the issue.

**55. Councillor Kevin Warnes**

Will the Leader of Council please update us on what the Council has done since 2013 - and is doing at present - to secure the redevelopment of the derelict site of the former Glenroyal Cinema on Briggate in Shipley?

**Response**

The Council does not own this site, and the owners of the land have not approached the Council to discuss opportunities for purchase or redevelopment. The site is listed as a potential development site in the Shipley Canal Road Corridor Area Action Plan and therefore we would welcome activity from the owner to see this site brought into use and are happy to discuss this with them if they wish.

**56. Councillor Anna Watson**

Will the leader of the Council please update us on how the proposed Shipley Development Framework that is in the process of being consulted on relates to the development of the Bradford District Local Plan? And when will the next stage of the Local Plan be published?

**Response**

The detailed Local Plan programme is being updated at present as work progresses on a range of technical evidence to support the final version of the policies and choice of sites. This work also has regard to the 30,000 plus representations received to the last consultation together with assessment of the several hundred new sites put forward for consideration. The work on the latest version of the local plan is looking to progress towards Executive and then Full Council in the autumn at the earliest. If members then approved the Local Plan it would then be published for

a six-week period for formal representations before being submitted to Government for examination (in 2024) by an Inspector. The timescales to adoption will then depend on the length of the examination.

As part of the work behind the Local Plan the Council has commissioned and undertaken a range of technical work to ensure it is based on robust and up to date evidence and information. Alongside these technical evidence document required by national policy and guidance there are a range of other studies being undertaken by the Council which while not essential will provide wider benefit to support a robust plan especially in support of its implementation and delivery of key regeneration and growth areas. In this respect the Development Frameworks are stand-alone studies, developed with key stakeholders and communities, to inform coordinated action to support development and change in key locations across the district. They go beyond spatial planning and they will inform work by the Council and other partners in key areas to support new development and provision of infrastructure. The work will inform the Local Plan and provide useful background and material consideration depending on the final status given them by the Council and they will not themselves form part of the Local Plan.

#### **57. Councillor Anna Watson**

ShIPLEY Town Council alongside ShIPLEY District Councillors, community groups and residents made an application to nominate the land at the old Hirst Wood Nursery site an Asset of Community Value in 2022. Can the leader let us know when the application will be considered as there has been no news on this for many months?

#### **Response**

Just prior to the ShIPLEY Area Committee meeting, 8th March 2023, the Clerk of ShIPLEY Town Council mentioned to officers that they had tried to submit a nomination to add Hirst Wood Nursery to the List of Assets of Community Value in April 2022. They were reminded of this because the annual Assets of Community value update was on the meeting's agenda and there was no mention of said nomination. Their email submission had been too large for the council servers to accept and an automatically generated message was sent back to the clerk informing them. They informed officers that after receiving the message they posted the nomination. However, we have no record of the posted nomination ever being received. It is standard practice that we contact nominators acknowledging their nomination within the first week. After the clerk brought this to our attention, arrangements were then made for the clerk to hand over the nomination form at the Area Committee meeting where it was received and accepted by officers. The nomination was therefore received on 8th March 2023 and we have a statutory deadline of eight weeks in which to make a decision, therefore the decision is due on or before 3rd May 2023. In recent years we have achieved a 100% success rate for assessing nominations within the deadline and I am confident we will publish the decision for this one on time as well.